

Early Care and Education Workforce Wages and Retention: Annotated Bibliography

There is research that examines the relationship between staff retention and staff compensation in the field of early care and education (ECE). This bibliography lists works of research that either identify such a relationship or report on initiatives intended to increase staff compensation. Each entry in this bibliography describes studies from the United States published between 2011 and 2021. Some reports examine additional variables (for example, classroom quality, workforce characteristics, teacher qualifications) in addition to the variables of retention and compensation.

These and other reports can be found in the Child Care and Early Education Research Connections research library by searching for keywords like “retention,” “compensation,” and “turnover” and filtering the results by Topical Classification #5, Child Care and Early Education Provider Workforce.

Adams, G., Ewen, D., & Luetmer, G. (2021). *Using contracts to support the child care workforce: Thinking outside the box.* Urban Institute.
<https://www.urban.org/sites/default/files/publication/104344/using-contracts-to-support-the-child-care-workforce.pdf>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/127501>.

Using contract-based financing mechanisms to meet child care goals is of increasing interest to policymakers and stakeholders seeking to address key issues and inequities in the child care system, including how to address the major challenges facing the child care/early care and education (CC/ECE) workforce. However, relatively little is known about different ways to use contract-financing mechanisms, their strengths and weaknesses, and which strategies can work best to accomplish different goals. Based on a literature review and convening of 26 experts, this report provides an overview of different ways states can design contracts to support the CC/ECE workforce to meet different goals. The new federal pandemic-relief child care investments provide policymakers and stakeholders with a unique opportunity to move quickly to design and implement contract-based strategies to support the workforce. The report first provides background information on the issues facing the CC/ECE workforce, defines contract-based financing mechanisms, and lists questions policymakers may want to consider as they weigh different options. It then focuses on ways to approach contracts to support the CC/ECE workforce and provides suggestions from the convening. (author abstract)

Bassok, D., Doromal, J. B., Michie, M., & Wong, V. C. (2020). *Reducing teacher turnover in early childhood settings: Findings from Virginia’s PDG B-5 Recognition Program.* University of Virginia. http://www.seepartnerships.com/uploads/1/3/2/8/132824390/pdg_teacher_turnover_study_summary.pdf

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/128456>.

Through two studies – one in Fairfax County and one in the other PDG B-5 communities – our project answers two research questions: 1) Does offering early educators up to \$1,500 – if they stay at their early care and education (ECE) sites – lead to increased employment stability? 2) Does the timing and frequency of payments (3 vs. 1) make a difference in ECE teacher stability? Through Virginia’s PDG B-5 initiative, and in partnership with the Virginia Department of Education, the Virginia Early Childhood Foundation, and the PDG pilot communities, the UVA team conducted the first-ever experiments to measure the effects of financial supports on teacher turnover in ECE settings. (author abstract)

California Child Development Division, Instruction and Learning Support Branch. (2013). *Report to the governor, the legislature, and the legislative analyst’s office: AB 212 Child Development Staff Retention Program*. California Department of Education.

<https://web.archive.org/web/20201206014507/http://www.cde.ca.gov/sp/cd/re/documents/lr/lrreport2012.pdf>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://www.researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/30616>.

This report is required by 2012 Budget Act Item 6110-194-0001, Provision 5, Schedule (1.5)(l) and California Education Code 8279.7(f). This report updates the Child Development Staff Retention Program legislative report submitted in 2011. The enclosed report includes, but is not limited to, a summary of the distribution of funds for the California Department of Education (CDE) Child Development Staff Retention Program by county and a description of the use of the funds. (author abstract)

Cassidy, D. J., King, E. K., Wang, Y. C., Lower, J. K., & Kintner-Duffy, V. L. (2017). *Teacher work environments are toddler learning environments: Teacher professional well-being, classroom emotional support, and toddlers’ emotional expressions and behaviours*. *Early Child Development and Care*, 187(11), 1666–1678.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/03004430.2016.1180516>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/34638>.

The current study examines the professional well-being of teachers, the classroom emotional support, and the emotional experiences of toddlers in their care. Professional well-being of teachers is conceptualized to include teacher feelings about their work, autonomy in decision-making, actual wages, and perceptions of fairness of wages within the programme as well as within the early childhood profession at large. The study empirically supports relationships among teacher professional well-being, classroom emotional support, and the emotional expressions and behaviours of toddlers. Early childhood policy implications regarding teacher professional well-being and toddler classroom emotional environments are discussed. (author abstract)

Caven, M., Khanani, N., Zhang, X., & Parker, C. E. (2021). *Center- and program-level factors associated with turnover in the early childhood education workforce* (REL 2021-069). Regional Educational Laboratory Northeast & Islands.

https://ies.ed.gov/ncee/edlabs/regions/northeast/pdf/REL_2021069.pdf

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://www.researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/39300>.

Staff turnover is a pressing problem in early childhood education. High turnover can create organizational instability and distract from the care and education mandate of early childhood education centers. The Early Childhood Workforce Development Research Alliance of the Regional Educational Laboratory Northeast & Islands wants to better understand the factors associated with turnover in the early childhood educator workforce. Using data from the 2012 National Survey of Early Care and Education, this study found that a low average turnover rate across early childhood education centers obscured systematic variation in turnover patterns across types of centers and programs, with high turnover rates in some types. Higher wages were associated with lower turnover rates across centers. Turnover rates were highest among private-pay centers serving children ages 0–5. Nonwage benefits such as health insurance and retirement benefits and paid time off for professional development were generally unrelated to turnover rates. Educators were also clustered into certain center types based on background characteristics; Black educators and educators with lower educational attainment more likely to work in centers with low wages and high turnover. (author abstract)

Child Care Services Association. (2020). *Child Care WAGE\$® program: Statewide final report: Fiscal year 2020*. https://www.childcareservices.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/08/Statewide_1920_Final_Full-Report.pdf

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/128436>.

This report includes results of a program to supplement the salaries of teachers, directors, and family child care providers, based on data from 3,292 child care professionals from 55 counties in North Carolina. Tables indicate demographic profiles and participation results of participants and turnover data. Appendices present sample survey feedback regarding the program's impact on retention, education, compensation, and recognition. This year's report reflects temporary adjustments due to COVID-related policy and procedure changes.

Child Care Services Association. (2021). *Child Care WAGE\$® program: Statewide final report: Fiscal year 2021*. https://www.childcareservices.org/wp-content/uploads/CCSA_WAGE_STATE_2021_Final_Full-Report.pdf

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/128431>.

This report includes results of a program to supplement the salaries of teachers, directors, and family child care providers, based on data from 3,089 child care professionals from 58 counties in North Carolina. Tables indicate demographic profiles and participation results of participants and turnover data. Appendices present sample survey feedback regarding the program's impact on retention, education, compensation, and recognition.

Child Care Services Association & T.E.A.C.H. Early Childhood National Center. (2020). *T.E.A.C.H. Early Childhood® and Child Care WAGE\$® annual national program report 2019–2020: Supporting the essential early childhood workforce behind*

the workforce. https://www.teachecnationalcenter.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/12/TEACH-Annual-Report-2019_2020.pdf

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/128466>.

This annual report describes the FY20 results of the T.E.A.C.H. Early Childhood program, a national strategy to increase college education and workforce supports for low-income women working in early childhood settings, and Child Care WAGE\$, a program that provides salary supplements to low-paid child care providers. Highlights, accomplishments, and teacher profiles from the T.E.A.C.H. National Center are also included.

Child Care Services Association & T.E.A.C.H. Early Childhood National Center. (2021). *T.E.A.C.H. Early Childhood® and Child Care WAGE\$® state profile compendium 2019–2020: Supporting the essential early childhood workforce behind the workforce.* <https://www.teachecnationalcenter.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/02/FY20-T.E.A.C.H.-WAGE-State-Profile-Compendium-.pdf>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/128471>.

The T.E.A.C.H. Early Childhood program is a national strategy to increase college education and workforce supports for low-income women working in early childhood settings, and Child Care WAGE\$ provides salary supplements to low-paid child care providers. This report provides information about the implementation of these programs in 22 states and the District of Columbia.

Early Childhood Educator INCENTIVE\$ Florida. (2019). *Early Childhood Educator INCENTIVE\$ Florida: 2018-2019 annual report.* <https://incentives-fl.org/download/early-childhood-educator-incentive-florida-2018-2019-annual-report/?wpdmdl=482&masterkey=5dc320f73b8bf>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/128486>.

This report describes the Early Childhood Educator INCENTIVE\$ Florida program and provides program results in the areas of increased compensation, increased education, and reduced turnover. Participating counties included Broward, Hillsborough, Miami-Dade, and Pinellas.

Early Childhood Educator INCENTIVE\$ Florida. (2020). *Early Childhood Educator INCENTIVE\$ Florida: 2019-2020 annual report.* <https://incentives-fl.org/download/incentive-annual-report-2020/?wpdmdl=550&masterkey=6092bc02bb26f>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/128481>.

This report describes the Early Childhood Educator INCENTIVE\$ Florida program and provides program results in the areas of increased compensation, increased education,

and reduced turnover. Participating counties included Broward, Hillsborough, and Miami-Dade.

Franchett, A., Carlson, J., & Epstein, D. J. (2019). *Spotlight on Minnesota's R.E.E.T.A.I.N. (Retaining Early Educators Through Attaining Incentives Now) grant program.* Child Trends. https://www.childtrends.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/MN-REETAIN-Spotlight_ChildTrends_December2019.pdf

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/37596>.

Minnesota's R.E.E.T.A.I.N. (Retaining Early Educators Through Attaining Incentives Now) was created by Child Care Aware (CCA) of Minnesota in 2002 to support the retention of committed and highly qualified early childhood education (ECE) teachers and providers. Child care providers are among some of the lowest paid workers in the in the country; because of this, retaining highly qualified providers can be challenging (Whitebook, McLean, Austin, & Edwards, 2019). Once providers obtain higher educational degrees (e.g., attain a bachelor's or master's degree), they may leave the field in search of higher wages. To address retention difficulties, R.E.E.T.A.I.N. offers two types of salary bonuses to qualified providers: one for center-based providers and one for home-based providers. (author abstract)

Gebhart, T., Carlson, J., Harris, P., & Epstein, D. J. (2020). *Workforce perceptions and experiences with the Alabama early care and education salary parity policy.* Child Trends. https://www.childtrends.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/FCD-Alabama-Brief_ChildTrends_June2020.pdf

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/38241>.

Although there has recently been an increased focus on the benefits and challenges of implementing a salary or compensation parity policy, little has been written about how these policies affect the ECE workforce directly. The purpose of this brief is to describe the effect of salary parity on the experiences of pre-K teachers from community-based ECE programs in Alabama. First, we provide a brief overview of ECE parity policies and describe the salary parity policy in Alabama. Next, we describe our methodology and key takeaways from interviews with directors and lead teachers in Alabama. Several key takeaways emerged from our conversations with ECE directors and teachers in Alabama. - With salary parity in place, there is an increased interest among teachers in joining the ECE workforce. - Salary parity may also be a useful strategy for increasing workforce retention. - Salary parity improves teachers' economic well-being but does not include other supports that compensation parity could provide. (author abstract)

Hilty, R., Paschall, K., Nagle, K., Moron, L., & Shaw, S. (2019). *Evaluation of R.E.E.T.A.I.N., Minnesota's child care workforce retention program – Technical appendix (DHS-7809A 1-19).* Child Trends for the Minnesota Department of Human Services. https://www.childtrends.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/12/Evaluation-of-REETAIN-Technical-Appendix_ChildTrends_Jan2019.pdf

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/36954>.

This technical appendix accompanies the main report and provides more information about the methods and findings. It includes the processes for convening the two advisory groups to solicit feedback on the study methods and findings, for reviewing the R.E.E.T.A.I.N. program implementation, and for scanning for similar retention initiatives. For the applicant survey and the accompanying qualitative interviews with applicants, the technical appendix describes our recruitment strategies, measures used, and patterns of missing data; all findings are broken down by key demographic and professional factors. (author abstract)

Isaacs, J. B., Adelstein, S., & Kuehn, D. (2018). *Early childhood educator compensation in the Washington region*. Urban Institute.
https://www.urban.org/sites/default/files/publication/97676/early_childhood_educator_compensation.pdf

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/35911>.

This study examines the compensation of early childhood educators in the Washington, DC, metropolitan region and considers the costs, benefits, and potential strategies associated with achieving parity with public school kindergarten teachers. It is one of several studies commissioned by the Washington Region Early Care and Education Workforce Network (the Network) to inform and support its efforts to help realize the recommendations in the Transforming the Workforce report. More generally, this report speaks to the ongoing debate over addressing persistently low ECE compensation as part of a broader strategy of professionalizing the workforce and improving quality across diverse early learning settings. (author abstract)

Johnson, A. D., Phillips, D. A., Schochet, O. N., Martin, A., Castle, S., & Tulsa SEED Study Team. (2021). To whom little is given, much is expected: ECE teacher stressors and supports as determinants of classroom quality. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, 54, 13–30. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecresq.2020.07.002>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/39076>.

Early care and education (ECE) teachers are paid strikingly low wages, yet are increasingly expected to advance children's learning by offering high-quality classroom environments. Teachers' capacities to provide high-quality instruction should be affected by the stressors they encounter and the supports they receive. However, ECE stressors and supports related to classroom quality, particularly those dimensions of quality reflecting the promotion of students' self-regulation, are understudied. The capacities teachers draw on to promote student self-regulation, such as patience, planning ability, positive affect, and scaffolding of peer interactions, may be precisely those abilities most likely to be impacted by their own stressors and supports. The current study measures the prevalence of a range of stressors (depressive symptoms, household chaos, less than very good health, teacher salary, food insecurity) and supports (in the workplace and at home) in a sample of ECE teachers serving low-income preschoolers in Tulsa, OK. Multilevel regression models then test for associations between those stressors and supports and observed measures of classroom quality – both the widely-used CLASS and newer measures that assess classroom management, social-emotional instruction, scaffolding of peer interactions, and use of power assertive and dismissive behavioral control – or “red

flag” – strategies. The majority of associations from stressors and supports to classroom quality measures were non-significant and effect sizes were small (ranging from 0.17-0.30). Of the stressors, only low teacher salary was significantly associated with quality outcomes, and only for just 2 of 8 outcomes tested (worse classroom management and poorer quality of instruction). Out of the 48 associations tested between the 6 workplace supports and 8 quality outcomes, fewer than one-third were statistically significant and not always in expected directions. Results underscore a need for replication with other samples, using direct measures of teacher stress, so that the field can better understand how these aspects of teachers’ experiences translate into classroom quality, and ultimately, to child outcomes. (author abstract)

Kashen, J., Potter, H., & Stettner, A. (2016). *Quality jobs, quality child care: The case for a well-paid, diverse early education workforce*. Century Foundation.
<https://production-tcf.imgix.net/app/uploads/2016/06/14145046/quality-jobs-quality-child-care.pdf>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/32606>.

This report focuses on achieving quality ECE by ensuring that its workforce is well-compensated, appropriately educated, diverse, and culturally competent. It looks particularly at strategies for maintaining diversity while transforming the industry so that it provides quality jobs and quality care, with a focus in this report on center-based and school-based care. This report recommends a multi-pronged strategy for strengthening early care and education, including increased public funding, new definitions of quality in ECE that include workforce compensation and diversity, expanded workforce development programs and career pathways, and policies to promote salary parity. (author abstract)

King, E. K., Van Schagen Johnson, A., Cassidy, D. J., Wang, Y. C., Lower, J. K., & Kintner-Duffy, V. L. (2016). *Preschool teachers’ financial well-being and work time supports: Associations with children’s emotional expressions and behaviors in classrooms*. *Early Childhood Education Journal*, 44(6), 545–553. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10643-015-0744-z>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/32628>.

The current study examined associations among teachers’ financial well-being, including teachers’ wages and their perceptions of their ability to pay for basic expenses, and teachers’ work time supports, including teachers’ paid planning time, vacation days, and sick days, and children’s positive emotional expressions and behaviors in preschool classrooms. Analyses controlled for teachers’ education and experience, as well as classroom quality (as assessed by the CLASS). Results suggest that teachers’ financial well-being is associated with children’s positive emotional expressions and behaviors in classrooms. Specifically, teachers’ wages positively relate to children’s positive emotional expressions and behaviors in classrooms, and children in classrooms of teachers who can pay for their basic expenses exhibit more positive emotional expressions and behaviors than children in classrooms of teachers who cannot pay for their basic expenses. Implications of the effects of early childhood teachers’ financial well-being on children’s emotional experiences in classrooms are discussed. (author abstract)

Maier, M. F. (2020). *Investing in the early care and education workforce*. MDRC.
https://www.mdrc.org/sites/default/files/Ideas_and_Evidence_EarlyCare_final.pdf

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at
<https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/38746>.

This brief focuses on three ways to support the workforce — increasing access to education and career growth, reinforcing workers' overall economic well-being, and improving working conditions. It integrates evidence-based practices and operational insights from MDRC's research in early care and education, as well as years of testing workforce development and training programs, which may help inform the selection and implementation of promising approaches to supporting the workforce. The end of this brief offers some recommendations on effectively supporting the early care and education workforce. (author abstract)

Main, C., Yarbrough, K. W., & Patten, B. (2018). *Voices from the front lines of early learning: 2017 Illinois early childhood workforce survey report*. University of Illinois at Chicago, College of Education.
<https://www2.illinois.gov/sites/OECD/Documents/2017%20Illinois%20Early%20Childhood%20Workforce%20Survey%20Report.pdf>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at
<https://www.researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/36786>.

The team determined that it was necessary to supplement existing data by creating and conducting this survey of early childhood administrators and hiring managers in Illinois across the different funding streams that support early childhood programs. Specifically, the aims of the survey were to: - examine the relationship between the need for qualified early childhood teachers and assistants and the hiring experiences of program administrators across targeted age ranges (e.g., infants and toddlers vs. preschoolers), program types (e.g., school-based vs. center-based vs. home-based child care) and funding sources (e.g., ECBG, CCAP, private tuition or Head Start and Early Head Start); and - better understand the experiences and perspectives of those charged with recruiting, hiring and retaining qualified staff. The results presented in this report represent the first comprehensive overview of the hiring needs and experiences, across all sectors, of the early childhood field in Illinois. (author abstract)

Markowitz, A. J., Bassok, D., Bellows, L., DiCarlo, C. F., Oakey-Frost, R., & Sonnier-Netto, L. (2021). *Senate resolution 29*. Louisiana Department of Education.
<https://www.louisianabelieves.com/docs/default-source/early-childhood/senate-resolution-29.pdf>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at
<https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/127191>.

This report presents key information about the costs of and funding mechanisms for early childhood care and education in Louisiana and the impacts on the early education workforce including (1) the prevalence of turnover, (2) potential drivers of turnover such as workforce wages and wellbeing, and (3) policies used in other states to address turnover. (author abstract)

Markowitz, A. J., Bassok, D., & Kiscaden, S. (2021). *Changes in early educator wellbeing and job commitment in the wake of the coronavirus pandemic: Lessons from large-scale surveys in Jefferson and Rapides Parishes*. University of Virginia, EdPolicyWorks. <https://files.elfsightcdn.com/022b8cb9-839c-4bc2-992e-cefccb8e877e/6d216e11-e7d6-4395-a613-9f3683dbe3f6.pdf>

Excerpt from the resource: “Whether teachers were very likely to remain in their job for six months, whether they were very likely to remain for three years, and whether teachers agreed that ECE was their long-term career—child care teachers were about 10 percentage points less likely to indicate agreement than their school-based peers” (Markowitz et al., 2021, p. 5).

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://www.researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/123341>.

We compared teacher emotional wellbeing, financial wellbeing and job commitment before and during COVID both overall and separately for child care and school-based pre-k sites using data from the fall 2019 and 2020 waves of the Study of Early Education in Louisiana Workforce Survey. In both years, surveys were sent to all teachers working with children ages 0-5, not yet in kindergarten working in publicly-funded child care and school-based state pre-k sites. In 2020, surveys were sent to sites that were open and providing care, either remotely or in-person. (author abstract)

McDougald Scott, A. M. (2021). *Benefits for child care workers: How the state could help through a Medicaid waiver*. *Journal of Working-Class Studies*, 6(1), 22–56. <https://doi.org/10.13001/jwcs.v6i1.6437>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/128151>.

Child care is expensive, and many parents struggle to afford care; furthermore, even though child care costs are high, child care providers in the United States (US) are not making a living wage. Child care professionals (ages 0-5 in child care homes or centers) earn less income than Kindergarten teachers, preK teachers, non-farm animal caretakers, and the US estimate of all workers’ annual median salary (Bureau of Labor Statistics, 2020a, 2020b). Workers in comparable professions are also usually offered benefits for their labor, which child care professionals are not (Kwon, 2019; National Survey of Early Care and Education Project Team, 2020; Otten et al., 2019; Whitebook, McLean, Austin, & Edwards, 2018). This often necessitates use of public assistance. Because many child care workers are not provided access to health insurance or other health-related benefits through their employers, they must seek access to health care in other ways. Additionally, turnover rates among child care workers are high, and wages and benefits are a large part of the reason why child care professionals leave their jobs (McDougald Scott, 2021a). This policy analysis (a) reviewed the current struggle (as of May 2021) that child care workers in the United States (in general) and South Carolina (in particular) experience compared with employees in other fields; and (b) explore options (particularly a Medicaid waiver option) that might improve the situation. South Carolina (SC) is one of the 13 states that have not expanded Medicaid; most of the 13 states are in Southern United States (US) region, which makes an extrapolation of SC research reasonable. Lessons learned from SC childcare data should reflect closely what may be found in other non-expansion states, but research from the literature review will not be SC-specific. Relevant peer-reviewed,

government documents, state and national data, and grey literature were reviewed and analyzed. There have been ongoing efforts (although insufficient even in more successful efforts) with mixed results to improve the pay for child care workers for decades. Progress for earning a living wage will require a systems overhaul for early education, but child care providers cannot wait for workforce environmental improvements. Action must be taken now to augment the shortage of healthcare access for child care providers. In SC, Medicaid helps some child care workers receive access to health care, but expansion through Medicaid waiver 1115 would include many more child care workers who do not currently have access. (author abstract)

McDougald Scott, A. M. (2021). *Examining the everyday life of child care workers: How low wages and the lack of benefits affect their lives and decisions about employment* [Doctoral dissertation, Clemson University]. All Dissertations. https://tigerprints.clemson.edu/all_dissertations/2778

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/128156>.

Child care workers' wages have been an issue that has plagued the early childhood education field for over five decades. Although research exists on child care workers' low wages, turnover rates, and lack of benefits, the details of daily life experiences from child care worker perspectives are scant. This study aims to add a lived experience perspective to the child care worker research, as well as provide stories which may be used as examples to inform policy change. This qualitative Participatory Action Research entailed semi-structured interviews with 14 child care workers to investigate: (a) the everyday life of child care workers; (b) how low wages and the lack of benefits affect child care workers' decisions to either switch between jobs within the field or leave the field; (c) what child care workers would like others to know. Fourteen child care workers who either worked in centers, owned Family Child Care Homes, or were nannies in Greenville County, South Carolina participated. Data from the semi-structured interviews were analyzed using an iterative process. (author abstract)

McLean, C., Dichter, H., & Whitebook, M. (2017). *Strategies in pursuit of pre-K teacher compensation parity: Lessons from seven states and cities*. University of California, Berkeley, Center for the Study of Child Care Employment; National Institute for Early Education Research. <https://cscce.berkeley.edu/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/Strategies-in-Pursuit-of-Pre-K.pdf>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/34867>.

Teachers in publicly funded pre-kindergarten programs across the nation are increasingly expected to earn educational qualifications and credentials similar to their peers teaching older children. Yet salaries and benefits remain consistently lower for pre-K teachers than for kindergarten and elementary school teachers. The Center for the Study of Child Care Employment (CSCCE), in partnership with the National Institute for Early Education Research (NIEER), has produced a series of materials that explore state policy efforts to move toward compensation parity between pre-K and K-3 teachers. This report -- *Strategies in Pursuit of Pre-K Teacher Compensation Parity: Lessons from Seven States and Cities* -- forms the third part of the series, examining a small set of states and cities with the goal of understanding the policy rationale and process for moving toward

compensation parity in different contexts. Cross-state analysis of the status of compensation parity policies revealed an astonishing array of variation, but no clear model of best practice. Consequently, the purpose of this report is to explore examples of strategies that states and cities have successfully taken forward along the path toward compensation parity for pre-K teachers. (author abstract)

McLean, C., Whitebook, M., & Roh, E. (2019). *From unlivable wages to just pay for early educators.* University of California, Berkeley, Center for the Study of Child Care Employment. <https://cscce.berkeley.edu/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/From-Unlivable-Wages-to-Just-Pay-for-Early-Educators.pdf>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/37258>.

Competing views on the primary reasons for compensation reform, what compensation reform looks like, and how to achieve compensation reform have led to the promotion of a variety of initiatives labeled “compensation strategies,” some of which do not actually raise on-the-job earnings at all, as discussed later in this report. In the hopes of offering clarification and guidance, this report summarizes recent research on wage standards and critically assesses existing initiatives commonly intended to address the problem of low wages in ECE. (author abstract)

Otten, J. J., Bradford, V. A., Stover, B., Hill, H. D., Osborne, C., Getts, K., & Seixas, N. (2019). *The culture of health in early care and education: Workers’ wages, health, and job characteristics.* *Health Affairs*, 38(5), 709–720. <https://doi.org/10.1377/hlthaff.2018.05493>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/37580>.

Little is known about the health of the 2.2 million early care and education (ECE) workers responsible for the care, well-being, and success of the approximately ten million children younger than age six enrolled in ECE, or the extent to which ECE environments and employers play a role in workers’ health. The purpose of this analysis was to describe the health of an ECE worker sample by wage and by job and center characteristics and to begin to explore the relationships between these factors and workers’ health. Our data indicate that ECE workers earn low wages and experience poor mental well-being and high rates of food insecurity. Lower-wage workers worked at centers with more children enrolled in subsidy programs and were more likely to work at centers that did not offer health insurance, paid sick leave, or parental or family leave. Policies and programs that raised workers’ wages or mandated the provision of meals to both children and workers could better support teacher health and the quality of ECE for children. Our results suggest that the culture of health in ECE settings and equity-related outcomes could be improved by helping centers provide support and flexibility to teachers (for example, offsetting workers’ benefit costs or reducing teacher-to-child ratios to reduce stress) who are managing their own health in the context of demanding work. (author abstract)

Palmer, J. (2018). *Building a qualified and supported early care and education workforce: A primer for legislators.* National Conference of State Legislatures. http://www.ncsl.org/Portals/1/Documents/cyf/Early-Care-Education_v06_web.pdf

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/36946>.

This document presents and discusses early care and education workforce data as it relates to preparation standards and support, compensation, and funding efforts. It includes a look at what states are doing to address these issues to support early childhood education workers.

Parrott, J. A. (2020). *The road to and from salary parity in New York City: Nonprofits and collective bargaining in early childhood education*. Center for New York City Affairs.
https://static1.squarespace.com/static/53ee4f0be4b015b9c3690d84/t/5e222c2ab457e7527ddc6450/1579297836053/SalaryParity_Parrott_Jan2020_Jan17.pdf

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/128446>.

This report examines the progress achieved with New York City's July 2019 commitment to early childhood education (ECE) starting pay salary parity that will raise pay for certified teachers in community-based organizations (CBOs) by 30-40 percent by October 1, 2021. The report chronicles developments on the "road to salary parity," and considers the challenges that lie ahead on the journey from this point to comprehensive parity, greater equity for ECE teachers coming up through the ranks, and greater accessibility to quality ECE for working families—this is the "road from salary parity." (author abstract)

Shaeen, A. (2016). *Successful employee retention strategies in childcare centers* [Doctoral dissertation, Walden University]. Walden University ScholarWorks.
<https://scholarworks.waldenu.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=4108&context=dissertations>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/128416>.

Fifty percent of childcare employees leave their jobs by the close of their 5th year of experience. The purpose of this exploratory single case study was to explore what retention strategies some childcare center directors use to retain their employees in the Columbus, Ohio metropolitan area. The research population consisted of 5 childcare center directors who successfully implemented retention strategies in 5 different childcare centers. The conceptual framework for this study was the Herzberg, Mausner, and Snyderman motivation-hygiene theory. Data were collected via semistructured interviews with the directors and from centers' handbooks and strategic plans. Coding, word frequency, and thematic analysis were conducted, and member checking was employed to bolster the trustworthiness of interpretations. Three main themes emerged: the importance of employee compensation, communication and culture, and education and training to retain childcare center employees. Understanding the strategies to retain employees may help childcare center directors reduce the turnover and ensure stability for employees in that industry. The implications for positive social change include lower unemployment rates and a more stable childcare labor market. (author abstract)

Sharrock, E., & Parkerson, C. (2020). *Equitable compensation for the child care workforce: Within reach and worth the investment*. Bank Street College of

Education.

<https://educate.bankstreet.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=1003&context=bsec>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/38741>.

Compensation and benefit parity coupled with access to high-quality professional learning can sustainably transform the quality of early care and education in this country. We owe it to our children to develop a system that not only is capable of delivering on their individual potential, but also recognizes caregivers, who are disproportionately women of color, with respect, dignity, and equality. Achieving this goal will require significant commitment, bold action, and trade-offs as we balance the competing needs within the field. We look forward to continuing to imagine what is possible for a fully redesigned system at scale. Ultimately, significant investment from the federal government is required to stabilize funding so that child care providers can build sustained and predictable salary increases into their overhead costs. (author abstract)

Shaw, S., Hilty, R., Lloyd, C. M., Nagle, K., Paschall, K., Warner-Richter, M., Moron, L., & Tout, K. (2019). *Evaluation of R.E.E.T.A.I.N., Minnesota's child care workforce retention program – Final report* (DHS-7809A 1-19). Child Trends for the Minnesota Department of Human Services. <https://www.childtrends.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/12/Evaluation-of-REETAIN-Final-Report-ChildTrends-Jan2019.pdf>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/36953>.

Reflecting growing attention to the importance of staff retention, Minnesota and several other states have invested in public initiatives to enhance wages for child care professionals. This study presents findings from an evaluation of Retaining Early Educators through Attaining Incentives Now (R.E.E.T.A.I.N.), a financial bonus program designed to improve workforce retention among highly trained child care professionals in Minnesota. Results from the study help inform recommendations regarding how the program can better support the child care workforce. (author abstract)

St.Clair-Christman, J., Buell, M. J., & Gamel-McCormick, M. (2011). Money matters for early education: The relationships among child care quality, teacher characteristics, and subsidy status. *Early Childhood Research & Practice, 13*(2). <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ956367.pdf>

Excerpt from the resource: “The results of this analysis indicate a positive relationship between teacher’s salary and child care quality” (St.Clair-Christman et al., 2011, Discussion section).

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/23721>.

Child care is the first out-of-home learning opportunity for many children. For low-income children, a high-quality child care placement can provide many of the experiences and skills that help build a foundation for later school success. Among the many measures of child care quality, some closely linked to later success in school are those assessing learning activities and children’s opportunities to develop language and reasoning skills.

Previous research in this area reveals that teacher characteristics such as education and wages are related to child care quality. However, there is less research on how funding streams, such as the federal child care subsidy program, influence child care quality. Using a sample from the Delaware (USA) Early Care and Education Baseline Quality Study, regression analysis was used to examine the relationships among teacher characteristics, program subsidy status, and the quality of care as defined by measures of language and reasoning and learning activities. The results indicate a relationship between child care quality and program subsidy status: Programs that do not accept subsidy funds are more likely to offer high-quality programming in language and reasoning activities that have a positive impact on children's development and school readiness. (author abstract)

Totenhagen, C. J., Hawkins, S. A., Casper, D. M., Bosch, L. A., Hawkey, K. R., & Borden, L. M. (2016). Retaining early childhood education workers: A review of the empirical literature. *Journal of Research in Childhood Education*, 30(4), 585–599.
<https://doi.org/10.1080/02568543.2016.1214652>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/32721>.

Low retention in the child care workforce is a persistent challenge that has been associated with negative outcomes for children, staff, and centers. This article reviews the empirical literature, identifying common correlates or predictors of retention for child care workers. Searches were conducted using several databases, and articles that presented quantitative or qualitative data on retention for center-based child care workers in the United States were reviewed in detail. Seven themes emerged as potential predictors of retention: wages and benefits, job satisfaction, organizational characteristics, alternative employment opportunities, demographic characteristics, job characteristics, and education and training. Although some of the findings were mixed, increased retention was generally associated with the following: working in a publicly operated or nonprofit center that meets accreditation or policy standards, being older, maintaining a higher-level position, having more tenure and experience, receiving higher wages, and reporting higher job satisfaction. Based on these studies, child care centers should seek to increase pay, recruit staff with more experience, and aim to improve job satisfaction among staff to help increase retention. In addition, government-funded professional development incentive programs may help child care centers meet the goals of a high-quality, educated, and stable workforce. (author abstract)

Ullrich, R., Hamm, K., & Schochet, L. (2017). *6 policies to support the early childhood workforce*. Center for American Progress.
<https://cdn.americanprogress.org/content/uploads/2017/02/06055236/WorkforcePolicy-report.pdf>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/34651>.

Moving forward, the workforce must be a priority in comprehensive legislation for early childhood care and education. In addition to increasing funding levels, the federal government must craft comprehensive policies to ensure that early childhood workers receive adequate compensation, benefits, and support for their professional growth--no matter where they work or who they serve. This report identifies six policies that the federal

government should include as part of significant federal financing reform for early care and education. These policies will be implemented in partnership with states and communities. (author abstract)

Whitebook, M., Phillips, D. A., & Howes, C. (2014). *Worthy work, STILL unlivable wages: The early childhood workforce 25 years after the National Child Care Staffing Study*. University of California, Berkeley, Center for the Study of Child Care Employment. <https://cscce.berkeley.edu/wp-content/uploads/2014/ReportFINAL.pdf>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/28662>.

This report is a compilation of studies and discussions addressing the working conditions of early childhood teachers in 1989 and 2014. Additional chapters address the consequences of compensation decisions, the use of public benefits among families of staff, and the variety of state and national policy efforts related to the wages of early childhood teachers.

Wilkins, M. (2020). Employee churn in after-school care: Manager influences on retention and turnover. *Journal of Youth Development*, 15(1), 94–121. <http://dx.doi.org/10.5195/jyd.2020.812>

The following abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/128426>.

This study examined field employee turnover at a national after-school program provider to assess the knowledge, skills, motivation, and organizational influences of those with the greatest impact on employee retention—area managers who oversee after-school programs and their frontline staff. Clark and Estes' (2008) gap analysis served as the general conceptual framework for the study. A convergent parallel mixed methods case study was conducted using historical document analysis, surveys, interviews, and observations. Analysis revealed high employee retention (74%) as well as high turnover (62%), which can coexist when most staff are retained, but a smaller segment repeatedly churns over the same period. Specifically, recurring turnover among 37% of staff roles was found to be the source of the high turnover rate, while 63% of roles remained filled and stable. Further analysis of managers' mindset illuminated barriers to success with retention, including limited knowledge of factors related to turnover, perception of minimal organizational focus on and resources for retention, significant external locus of control over turnover, and lack of ownership and accountability for turnover. After implementing context-specific solutions grounded in literature and in the New World Kirkpatrick Model (Kirkpatrick & Kirkpatrick, 2016), a 1-year follow-up indicated elevations in 16 of 17 areas of manager mindset around retention, including 90% or higher agreement in 12 of 17 areas, a 22% decrease in turnover, an 8% increase in stable roles, and an 11% decrease in unstable or repeatedly churning roles. (author abstract)

Zepeda, A. (2015). *Stability of teaching staff in LAUP programs*. Los Angeles Universal Preschool. https://child360.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/08/LAUP_WD_FULLREPORT_STABILITY_rev20160330.pdf

This resource is an examination of staff turnover at the Los Angeles Universal Preschool program at both the classroom and site levels. Interviews and data revealed the search for higher

compensation as the main reason for staff turnover. Program quality and classroom environment ratings were also found to be associated with lower turnover. Higher degree attainment was not found to be a significant protective factor against turnover. Rates of turnover varied in public, nonprofit, for-profit, and family child care settings.

An author abstract is available on the Research Connections website at <https://researchconnections.org/childcare/resources/33560>.

This project is supported by the Administration for Children and Families (ACF) of the United States Department of Health and Human Services (HHS) as part of a 5-year financial assistance award (Grant No. 90YE250) totaling \$3,953,308, with 100 percent funded by ACF/HHS. The contents are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily represent the official views of, nor an endorsement by, ACF/HHS or the U.S. Government. For more information, please visit the ACF website at [Administrative and National Policy Requirements](#).

